



Gravitational wave modeling for non-circular binary black holes within the effective one-body approach

Andrea Placidi

Work in collaboration with:

Simone Albanesi, Sebastiano Bernuzzi, Gianluca Grignani, Troels Harmark, Alessandro Nagar, Marta Orselli **More details in the references:**

arXiv:2112.05448 Phys. Rev. D 105 (2022) 10, 104030

arXiv:2202.10063 Phys. Rev. D 105 (2022) 10, 104031

arXiv:2203.16286 Phys. Rev. D 105 (2022) 12, L121503

Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



Gravitational wave (GW) astronomy feats



Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



Gravitational wave (GW) astronomy feats



LIGO-India, Cosmic Explorer, Einstein Telescope, LISA, TianQuin, Taiji, Pulsar timing arrays

Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



For any given astrophysical source, data analysis in GW astronomy requires the general prior knowledge of the respective GW signals $h(t,\theta) = F_+ h_+(t,\theta) + F_\times h_\times(t,\theta)$

 $h_+, h_{\times} \equiv |$ physical polarizations of the GW $|| \theta \equiv$ set of parameters of the source



For any given astrophysical source, data analysis in GW astronomy requires the general prior knowledge of the respective GW signals $h(t,\theta) = F_+ h_+(t,\theta) + F_\times h_\times(t,\theta)$

 $h_+, h_{\times} \equiv |$ physical polarizations of the GW $| \theta \equiv$ set of parameters of the source

Primary GW sources: **coalescing compact binaries** of black holes (BH) One needs:

CCB evolution



Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



For any given astrophysical source, data analysis in GW astronomy requires the general prior knowledge of the respective GW signals $h(t,\theta) = F_+ h_+(t,\theta) + F_\times h_\times(t,\theta)$

 $h_+, h_{\times} \equiv |$ physical polarizations of the GW $| \theta \equiv$ set of parameters of the source

Primary GW sources: **coalescing compact binaries** of black holes (BH) One needs:















Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023





Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



EOB basic idea:





EOB basic idea:





EOB basic idea:

Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



EOB basic idea:



Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023





Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023





Andrea Placidi





Andrea Placidi





Andrea Placidi



Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



Isolated binaries circularize rapidly...
$$(e \sim 10^{-6} \text{ at } f_{\text{orb}} = 10 \text{ Hz})$$

Quasi-circular (qc) approximation

Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



Isolated binaries circularize rapidly...

$$\rightarrow \bigcirc (e \sim 10^{-6} \text{ at } f_{\text{orb}} = 10 \text{Hz})$$

Quasi-circular (qc) approximation

... but dynamical encounters in dense stellar environments and the Lidov-Kozai mechanism in hierarchical three-body systems can lead to non-circular binaries Non-circular (nc) corrections in the waveform models



Isolated binaries circularize rapidly...

$$\rightarrow (e \sim 10^{-6} \text{ at } f_{\text{orb}} = 10 \text{Hz})$$

Quasi-circular (qc) approximation

... but dynamical encounters in dense stellar environments and the Lidov-Kozai mechanism in hierarchical three-body systems can lead to non-circular binaries Non-circular (nc) corrections in the waveform models

We worked on improving the non-circular branch of **TEOBResumS**:

$$h_{+} - ih_{\times} = D_{L}^{-1} \sum_{\ell=2}^{\ell} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell} h_{\ell m} - 2Y_{\ell m}(\Theta, \Phi)$$
Newtonian factors
PN quasi-circular factor
[Chiaramello-Nagar 2020]
$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{qc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{N_{nc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{qc}$$
TEOBResumS-DALI before
our work



Isolated binaries circularize rapidly...

$$\rightarrow (e \sim 10^{-6} \text{ at } f_{\text{orb}} = 10 \text{Hz})$$

➡> Quasi-circular (qc) approximation

... but dynamical encounters in dense stellar environments and the Lidov-Kozai mechanism in hierarchical three-body systems can lead to non-circular binaries Non-circular (nc) corrections in the waveform models

We worked on improving the non-circular branch of **TEOBResumS**:

$$h_{+} - ih_{\times} = D_{L}^{-1} \sum_{\ell=2}^{\ell} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell} h_{\ell m} - 2Y_{\ell m}(\Theta, \Phi)$$
Newtonian factors
PN quasi-circular factor
[Chiaramello-Nagar 2020]
$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{qc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{N_{nc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{qc}$$
TEOBResumS-DALI before
our work



Isolated binaries circularize rapidly...

$$\rightarrow (e \sim 10^{-6} \text{ at } f_{\text{orb}} = 10 \text{Hz})$$

Quasi-circular (qc) approximation

... but dynamical encounters in dense stellar environments and the Lidov-Kozai mechanism in hierarchical three-body systems can lead to non-circular binaries Non-circular (nc) corrections in the waveform models

We worked on improving the non-circular branch of **TEOBResumS**:

$$h_{+} - ih_{\times} = D_{L}^{-1} \sum_{\ell=2}^{\ell} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell} h_{\ell m} - 2Y_{\ell m}(\Theta, \Phi)$$
 Newtonian factors PN quasi-circular factor

$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{qc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{N_{nc}} \hat{h}_{q m}^{qc}$$
 (Chiaramello-Nagar 2020)
TEOBResumS-DALI before
our work
Non-circular extension of the PN sector
with an extra PN non-circular factor for
each spherical mode

$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{qc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{N_{nc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{qc} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc}$$

$$e. Translating in EOB variables generic-planar-orbit PN
results for the spherical modes $h_{\ell m}$

$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{qc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{N_{nc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{qc} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc}$$

$$TEOBResumS-DALI with our
2PN non-circular extension$$$$



Current results

With a first version of our non-circular factors $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc}$ we succeeded in improving how TEOBResumS-DALI deals with non-circularized binaries:

- Increased analytical/numerical agreement of the waveform phase
- More accurate fluxes of energy and angular momentum at infinity

$$\dot{E} = \frac{1}{16\pi} \sum_{\ell=2}^{\ell_{\max}} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell} |\dot{h}_{\ell m}|^2 \qquad \dot{J} = -\frac{1}{16\pi} \sum_{\ell=2}^{\ell_{\max}} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell} m \Im(\dot{h}_{\ell m} h_{\ell m}^*)$$



Current results

With a first version of our non-circular factors $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc}$ we succeeded in improving how TEOBResumS-DALI deals with non-circularized binaries:

- Increased analytical/numerical agreement of the waveform phase
- More accurate fluxes of energy and angular momentum at infinity

$$\dot{E} = \frac{1}{16\pi} \sum_{\ell=2}^{\ell_{\max}} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell} |\dot{h}_{\ell m}|^2 \qquad \dot{J} = -\frac{1}{16\pi} \sum_{\ell=2}^{\ell_{\max}} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell} m \Im(\dot{h}_{\ell m} h_{\ell m}^*)$$

Then, we developed an updated version of $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc}$, with **explicit time derivatives**, that further improves the fluxes at infinity and also enhances the analytical/numerical agreement of the waveform amplitude



Current results

With a first version of our non-circular factors $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc}$ we succeeded in improving how TEOBResumS-DALI deals with non-circularized binaries:

- Increased analytical/numerical agreement of the waveform phase
- More accurate fluxes of energy and angular momentum at infinity

$$\dot{E} = \frac{1}{16\pi} \sum_{\ell=2}^{\ell_{\max}} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell} |\dot{h}_{\ell m}|^2 \qquad \dot{J} = -\frac{1}{16\pi} \sum_{\ell=2}^{\ell_{\max}} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell} m \Im(\dot{h}_{\ell m} h_{\ell m}^*)$$

Then, we developed an updated version of $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc}$, with **explicit time derivatives**, that further improves the fluxes at infinity and also enhances the analytical/numerical agreement of the waveform amplitude

Future projects in this direction

- 2.5PN noncircular factors (with the inclusion of oscillatory memory effects) in preparation, almost ready
- Additional noncircular waveform information for spinning binaries



Thanks for your attention!



Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



EXTRA SLIDES

10

Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



Bad convergence of the PN series

Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



Bad convergence of the PN series

- [Cutler et al. '93]: Slow convergence of the PN series
- [Thorne-Brady-Creighton '98]: PN results can't be used in the strong field regime, in the last ~10 orbits of the inspiral they are unreliable
- [Damour-Iyer-Sathyaprakash '98]: particle around a Schwarzschild BH

The PN series is badly convergent and erratic...





Bad convergence of the PN series

- [Cutler et al. '93]: Slow convergence of the PN series
- [Thorne-Brady-Creighton '98]: PN results can't be used in the strong field regime, in the last ~10 orbits of the inspiral they are unreliable
- [Damour-Iyer-Sathyaprakash '98]: particle around a Schwarzschild BH

The PN series is badly convergent and erratic...

...but after proper resummations there is a substantial improvement!



Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



Real and effective dynamics

Dictionary between the two dynamics (no spin for simplicity):



Real and effective dynamics

Dictionary between the two dynamics (no spin for simplicity):

Established in terms of **Delaunay Hamiltonians:** energy levels of the bound states expressed in terms of **action variables**, which are quantized according to the semi-classical rules of **Bohr-Sommerfeld**

$$J \equiv \frac{1}{2\pi} \oint p_{\varphi} d\varphi = \ell \hbar$$
$$I_r \equiv \frac{1}{2\pi} \oint p_r dr$$
$$N \equiv I_r + J = n\hbar$$




Dictionary between the two dynamics (no spin for simplicity):

Established in terms of **Delaunay Hamiltonians**: energy levels of the bound states expressed in terms of **action variables**, which are quantized according to the semi-classical rules of **Bohr-Sommerfeld**

$$J \equiv \frac{1}{2\pi} \oint p_{\varphi} d\varphi = \ell \hbar$$
$$I_r \equiv \frac{1}{2\pi} \oint p_r dr$$
$$N \equiv I_r + J = n\hbar$$

12

 $E_{\text{real}} Mc^{2}$ = $n+1, \ell \dots n+1, \ell+1$ n, ℓ $E_{\text{real}}(N_{\text{real}}, J_{\text{real}}) = E_{\text{real}}(n, \ell)$ [Buonanno-Damour '99] = = $n+1, \ell \dots n+1, \ell+1$ $n = n_{\text{real}} = n_{\text{eff}}$ $\ell = \ell_{\text{real}} = \ell_{\text{eff}}$

obtained from the knowledge of the two-body ADM Hamiltonian



Dictionary between the two dynamics (no spin for simplicity):

[Buonanno-Damour '99] Established in terms of **Delaunay Hamiltonians:** $\mathscr{C}_{\mathrm{eff}}$ E_{real} energy levels of the bound states expressed in terms Mc^2 of action variables, which are quantized according to the semi-classical rules of **Bohr-Sommerfeld** $-n+1, \ell - n+1, \ell+1$ $-n+1.\ell$ $-n+1, \ell+1$ $J \equiv \frac{1}{2\pi} \oint p_{\varphi} d\varphi = \ell \hbar$ $n = n_{\text{real}} = n_{\text{eff}}$ $-n,\ell$ $-n.\ell$ $I_r \equiv \frac{1}{2\pi} \oint p_r \, dr$ $\ell = \ell_{\text{real}} = \ell_{\text{eff}}$ $E_{\text{real}}(N_{\text{real}}, J_{\text{real}}) = E_{\text{real}}(n, \ell)$ $\mathscr{E}_{\text{eff}}(N_{\text{eff}}, J_{\text{eff}}) = \mathscr{E}_{\text{eff}}(n, \ell)$ $\theta = \pi/2$ $N \equiv I_r + J = n\hbar$ obtained from the knowledge of $g_{\text{eff}}^{\mu\nu} p_{\mu} p_{\nu} + \mu^2 c^2 + Q(p_{\mu}, \{z_i\}) = 0$ $P_{\mu} = \partial S_{\text{eff}} / \partial x^{\mu}$ • Solve for S_r with $I_r = \frac{2}{2\pi} \int_{r_{\text{min}}}^{r_{\text{max}}} \frac{dS_r}{dr} dr$ the two-body ADM Hamiltonian $p_{\mu} = \partial S_{\rm eff} / \partial x^{\mu}$ $S_{\text{eff}} = -\mathscr{C}_{\text{eff}} t + J_{\text{eff}} \varphi + S_r(\mathscr{C}_{\text{eff}}, J_{\text{eff}}, r)$ • Invert for \mathscr{C}_{eff}

12



Dictionary between the two dynamics (no spin for simplicity):

[Buonanno-Damour '99] Established in terms of **Delaunay Hamiltonians:** $\mathscr{C}_{\mathrm{eff}}$ E_{real} energy levels of the bound states expressed in terms Mc^2 of action variables, which are quantized according to the semi-classical rules of **Bohr-Sommerfeld** $-n+1, \ell - n+1, \ell+1$ $-n+1,\ell$ $-n+1.\ell+1$ $J \equiv \frac{1}{2\pi} \oint p_{\varphi} d\varphi = \ell \hbar$ $n = n_{\text{real}} = n_{\text{eff}}$ $-n,\ell$ $-n.\ell$ $I_r \equiv \frac{1}{2\pi} \oint p_r \, dr$ $\ell = \ell_{\text{real}} = \ell_{\text{eff}}$ $E_{\text{real}}(N_{\text{real}}, J_{\text{real}}) = E_{\text{real}}(n, \ell)$ $\mathscr{E}_{\text{eff}}(N_{\text{eff}}, J_{\text{eff}}) = \mathscr{E}_{\text{eff}}(n, \ell)$ $\theta = \pi/2$ $N \equiv I_r + J = n\hbar$ obtained from the knowledge of $g_{\text{eff}}^{\mu\nu} p_{\mu} p_{\nu} + \mu^2 c^2 + Q(p_{\mu}, \{z_i\}) = 0$ $P_{\mu} = \partial S_{\text{eff}} / \partial x^{\mu}$ • Solve for S_r with $I_r = \frac{2}{2\pi} \int_{r_{\text{min}}}^{r_{\text{max}}} \frac{dS_r}{dr} dr$ the two-body ADM Hamiltonian $p_{\mu} = \partial S_{\rm eff} / \partial x^{\mu}$ $S_{\text{eff}} = -\mathscr{C}_{\text{eff}} t + J_{\text{eff}} \varphi + S_r(\mathscr{C}_{\text{eff}}, J_{\text{eff}}, r) \cdot \text{Invert for } \mathscr{C}_{\text{eff}}$

Energy map between $\mathscr{C}_{\text{eff}}^{\text{NR}} \equiv \mathscr{C}_{\text{eff}} - \mu c^2$ and $E_{\text{real}}^{\text{NR}} \equiv E_{\text{real}} - Mc^2$

Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



Dictionary between the two dynamics (no spin for simplicity):

[Buonanno-Damour '99] Established in terms of **Delaunay Hamiltonians:** E_{real} $\mathscr{E}_{\mathrm{eff}}$ energy levels of the bound states expressed in terms Mc^2 of action variables, which are quantized according to the semi-classical rules of **Bohr-Sommerfeld** $-n+1, \ell$ $-n+1.\ell$ $J \equiv \frac{1}{2\pi} \oint p_{\varphi} d\varphi = \ell \hbar$ $n = n_{\text{real}} = n_{\text{eff}}$ $-n,\ell$ $-n.\ell$ $I_r \equiv \frac{1}{2\pi} \oint p_r \, dr$ $\ell = \ell_{\text{real}} = \ell_{\text{eff}}$ $E_{\text{real}}(N_{\text{real}}, J_{\text{real}}) = E_{\text{real}}(n, \ell)$ $\mathscr{E}_{\text{eff}}(N_{\text{eff}}, J_{\text{eff}}) = \mathscr{E}_{\text{eff}}(n, \ell)$ $\theta = \pi/2$ $N \equiv I_r + J = n\hbar$ obtained from the knowledge of the two-body ADM Hamiltonian $p_{\mu} = \partial S_{\rm eff} / \partial x^{\mu}$ $S_{\text{eff}} = -\mathscr{C}_{\text{eff}} t + J_{\text{eff}} \varphi + S_r(\mathscr{C}_{\text{eff}}, J_{\text{eff}}, r)$ • Invert for \mathscr{C}_{eff} $\longrightarrow \frac{\mathscr{C}_{\text{eff}}^{\text{NR}}}{\mu c^2} = \frac{E_{\text{real}}^{\text{NR}}}{\mu c^2} \left| 1 + \alpha_1 \frac{E_{\text{real}}^{\text{NR}}}{\mu c^2} + \alpha_2 \left(\frac{E_{\text{real}}^{\text{NR}}}{\mu c^2} \right)^2 + \alpha_3 \left(\frac{E_{\text{real}}^{\text{NR}}}{\mu c^2} \right)^3 + \dots \right| \longrightarrow \begin{array}{l} \text{System of equations for the parameters } \tilde{a}_i, \tilde{b}_i, z_i, \text{ and } \alpha_i \\ \text{(underconstrained system)} \end{array}$ Energy map between $\mathscr{E}_{\text{eff}}^{\text{NR}} \equiv \mathscr{E}_{\text{eff}} - \mu c^2$ and $E_{\rm real}^{\rm NR} \equiv E_{\rm real} - Mc^2$ Andrea Placidi

Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



However...

 Dynamical encounters in dense stellar environments (globular clusters, galactic nuclei) and the Lidov-Kozai mechanism in compact triples may lead to CBC with measurable eccentricity



However...

Dynamical encounters in dense stellar environments (globular clusters, galactic nuclei) and the Lidov-Kozai mechanism in compact triples may lead to CBC with measurable eccentricity → info on binary formation channels [Lower et al. 2018]





However...

Dynamical encounters in dense stellar environments (globular clusters, galactic nuclei) and the Lidov-Kozai mechanism in compact triples may lead to CBC with measurable eccentricity → info on binary formation channels [Lower et al. 2018]

[Gamba et al. 2021]: GW190521 analysis in a dynamical capture scenario





However...

Dynamical encounters in dense stellar environments (globular clusters, galactic nuclei) and the Lidov-Kozai mechanism in compact triples may lead to CBC with measurable eccentricity → info on binary formation channels [Lower et al. 2018]

[Gamba et al. 2021]: GW190521 analysis in a dynamical capture scenario



• Neglecting eccentricity can cause systematic errors in parameter inference [Favata 2014, Favata et al 2022] and induce bias in GR tests [Bhat et al 2022]



However...

Dynamical encounters in dense stellar environments (globular clusters, galactic nuclei) and the Lidov-Kozai mechanism in compact triples may lead to CBC with measurable eccentricity → info on binary formation channels [Lower et al. 2018]

[Gamba et al. 2021]: GW190521 analysis in a dynamical capture scenario



• Neglecting eccentricity can cause systematic errors in parameter inference [Favata 2014, Favata et al 2022] and induce bias in GR tests [Bhat et al 2022]

The orbital eccentricity has a significant role in CBC waveform models! EOB models need corresponding **non-circular corrections**

13



Native quasi-circular version of TEOBResumS:

 $h_{+} - ih_{\times} = D_{L}^{-1} \sum_{\ell=2}^{\ell} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell} h_{\ell m - 2} Y_{\ell m}(\Theta, \Phi)$



Native quasi-circular version of TEOBResumS:

$$h_{+} - ih_{\times} = D_{L}^{-1} \sum_{\ell=2}^{r} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{t} \frac{h_{\ell m}}{h_{\ell m}} Y_{\ell m}(\Theta, \Phi)$$

$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{qc}} \hat{h}_{qc}^{qc}$$

[Nagar et al. 2020] [Riemenschneider et al. 2021]



Native quasi-circular version of TEOBResumS:

$$h_{+} - ih_{\times} = D_{L}^{-1} \sum_{\ell=2}^{l} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{l} \underbrace{h_{\ell m}}_{p} 2Y_{\ell m}(\Theta, \Phi)$$
[Nagar et al. 2020]

$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{qc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{qc}$$
[Riemenschneider et al. 2021]

$$h_{\ell m}^{N_{qc}} \rightarrow \text{Newtonian factor}$$
Leading contribution of $h_{\ell m}$ in its PN expansion



Native quasi-circular version of TEOBResumS:

$$h_{+} - ih_{\times} = D_{L}^{-1} \sum_{\ell=2}^{r_{max}} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell} \underbrace{h_{\ell m}}_{p_{\ell m}} - 2Y_{\ell m}(\Theta, \Phi)$$
[Nagar et al. 2020]
[Riemenschneider et al. 2021]

$$h_{\ell m}^{N_{qc}} \rightarrow \text{Newtonian factor} \quad \text{Leading contribution of } h_{\ell m} \text{ in its PN expansion}$$

$$\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{qc} \rightarrow \text{Quasi-circular PN factor} \quad \text{Residual PN information in factorized form}$$

$$\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{qc} = \hat{S}_{eff} T_{\ell m} \times e^{i\delta_{\ell m}} f_{\ell m} \times \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{NQC} \quad \text{[Damour-lyer-Nagar 2009]}$$

Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



Native quasi-circular version of TEOBResumS:





Native quasi-circular version of TEOBResumS:



Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



Native quasi-circular version of TEOBResumS:



Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



First non-circular extension:

$$h_{+} - ih_{\times} = D_{L}^{-1} \sum_{\ell=2}^{t} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{t} h_{\ell m} - 2Y_{\ell m}(\Theta, \Phi)$$

$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{qc}} \hat{h}_{qc}^{qc}$$



First non-circular extension:



Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



First non-circular extension:



resum non-circular

Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



First non-circular extension:



$$h_{22}^{N_{\rm qc}} = -8\sqrt{\frac{\pi}{5}(r\dot{\varphi})^2}e^{-2i\varphi} \qquad \hat{h}_{22}^{N_{\rm nc}} = 1 - \frac{\ddot{r}}{2r\dot{\varphi}^2} - \frac{\dot{r}^2}{2(r\dot{\varphi})^2} + i\left(\frac{2\dot{r}}{r\dot{\varphi}} + \frac{\ddot{\varphi}}{2\dot{\varphi}^2}\right)$$

the time derivatives of the EOB variables (besides the orbital frequency $\Omega \equiv \dot{\phi}$) resum non-circular contribution at every PN order

Non-circular PN information is still missing!

15

Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



Noncircular extension of the PN sector:



 $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm nc} \rightarrow \text{Noncircular PN factor}$ (2PN accurate for now)

Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



Noncircular extension of the PN sector: ℓ_{max}

$$h_{+} - ih_{\times} = D_{L}^{-1} \sum_{\ell=2}^{m} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\infty} h_{\ell m} - 2Y_{\ell m}(\Theta, \Phi)$$

$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{qc}} \hat{h}_{lm}^{N_{nc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{qc} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc}$$



Calculation procedure:

Starting generic-orbit waveform mode

$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N} + \frac{1}{c^{2}} h_{\ell m}^{1 \text{PN}_{\text{inst}}} + \frac{1}{c^{3}} h_{\ell m}^{1.5 \text{PN}_{\text{tail}}} + \frac{1}{c^{4}} h_{\ell m}^{2 \text{PN}_{\text{inst}}} + O\left(c^{-5}\right)$$

Obtained by **translating in EOB variables** the generic-orbit spherical modes $h_{\ell m}$ provided in [Mishra-Arun-Iyer 2015], [Boetzel et al. 2019], [Khalil et al. 2021]



Noncircular extension of the PN sector:



 $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm nc} \rightarrow \text{Noncircular PN factor}$ (2PN accurate for now)

Calculation procedure:

Starting generic-orbit waveform mode

$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N} + \frac{1}{c^{2}} h_{\ell m}^{1 \text{PN}_{\text{inst}}} + \frac{1}{c^{3}} h_{\ell m}^{1.5 \text{PN}_{\text{tail}}} + \frac{1}{c^{4}} h_{\ell m}^{2 \text{PN}_{\text{inst}}} + O\left(c^{-5}\right)$$

Obtained by **translating in EOB variables** the generic-orbit spherical modes $h_{\ell m}$ provided in [Mishra-Arun-Iyer 2015], [Boetzel et al. 2019], [Khalil et al. 2021]



Noncircular extension of the PN sector:



 $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm nc} \rightarrow \text{Noncircular PN factor}$ (2PN accurate for now)

Calculation procedure:

Starting generic-orbit waveform mode

$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N} + \frac{1}{c^{2}} h_{\ell m}^{1 \text{PN}_{\text{inst}}} + \frac{1}{c^{3}} h_{\ell m}^{1.5 \text{PN}_{\text{tail}}} + \frac{1}{c^{4}} h_{\ell m}^{2 \text{PN}_{\text{inst}}} + O\left(c^{-5}\right)$$

Circular limit

Obtained by **translating in EOB variables** the generic-orbit spherical modes $h_{\ell m}$ provided in [Mishra-Arun-Iyer 2015], [Boetzel et al. 2019], [Khalil et al. 2021]

Circular limit:

 $p_r \rightarrow 0$ as well as all the time derivatives of the EOB variables, except for $\dot{\phi}$

Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023

 $\hat{h}^{\mathrm{qc}}_{\ell m}$



Noncircular extension of the PN sector:



 $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm nc} \rightarrow \text{Noncircular PN factor}$ (2PN accurate for now)

Calculation procedure:

Starting generic-orbit waveform mode $h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^N + \frac{1}{c^2} h_{\ell m}^{1\text{PN}_{\text{inst}}} + \frac{1}{c^3} h_{\ell m}^{1.5\text{PN}_{\text{tail}}} + \frac{1}{c^4} h_{\ell m}^{2\text{PN}_{\text{inst}}} + O(c^{-5})$ Obtained by translating in EOB variables
the generic-orbit spherical modes $h_{\ell m}$
provided in [Mishra-Arun-Iyer 2015],
[Boetzel et al. 2019], [Khalil et al. 2021] $\hat{h}_{\ell m} = \frac{h_{\ell m}}{h_{\ell m}^N}$ Circular limit
 $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^q$ Circular limit:
 $p_r \to 0$ as well as all the time derivatives
of the EOB variables, except for $\dot{\phi}$ $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc} = T_{2\text{PN}}$ $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^q$ $T_{2\text{PN}} \to \text{PN Taylor expansion}$
truncated at the 2PN order

16

Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



Noncircular extension of the PN sector:

$$h_{+} - ih_{\times} = D_{L}^{-1} \sum_{\ell=2}^{max} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\ell} h_{\ell m} - 2Y_{\ell m}(\Theta, \Phi)$$

$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{qc}} \hat{h}_{lm}^{N_{nc}} \hat{h}_{qc}^{qc} \hat{h}_{lm}^{nc}$$



Internal structure:

$$\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm nc} \equiv T_{\rm 2PN} \left[\frac{\hat{h}_{\ell m}}{\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm qc}} \right] = 1 + \frac{1}{c^2} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm 1PN_{\rm inst,nc}} + \frac{1}{c^3} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm 1.5PN_{\rm tail,nc}} + \frac{1}{c^4} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm 2PN_{\rm inst,nc}}$$

Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



Noncircular extension of the PN sector: lmax l

$$h_{+} - ih_{\times} = D_{L}^{-1} \sum_{\ell=2}^{m} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\infty} h_{\ell m} - 2Y_{\ell m}(\Theta, \Phi)$$

$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{qc}} \hat{h}_{nc}^{N_{nc}} \hat{h}_{qc}^{qc} \hat{h}_{nc}^{nc}$$

$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{qc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{N_{nc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{qc} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc}$$

$$\hat{h}_{nc}^{nc} \rightarrow \text{Noncircular PN factor (2PN accurate for not set of the set$$

$$p_{\ell m}^{\rm nc} \rightarrow \text{Noncircular PN factor}$$
 (2PN accurate for now)

Internal structure:

$$\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc} \equiv T_{2PN} \left[\frac{\hat{h}_{\ell m}}{\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{qc}} \right] = 1 + \frac{1}{c^2} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{1PN_{inst,nc}} + \frac{1}{c^3} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{1.5PN_{tail,nc}} + \frac{1}{c^4} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{2PN_{inst,nc}} \right]$$
Additional factorization
$$\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc} = \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc_{inst}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc_{tail}} - \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc_{inst}} \equiv 1 + \frac{1}{c^2} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{1PN_{inst,nc}} + \frac{1}{c^4} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{2PN_{inst,nc}} - \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc_{tail}} \equiv 1 + \frac{1}{c^3} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{1.5PN_{tail,nc}}$$

Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



Noncircular extension of the PN sector: lmax l

$$h_{+} - ih_{\times} = D_{L}^{-1} \sum_{\ell=2}^{m} \sum_{m=-\ell}^{\infty} h_{\ell m} - 2Y_{\ell m}(\Theta, \Phi)$$

$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{qc}} \hat{h}_{lm}^{N_{nc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{qc} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc}$$

$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{qc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{N_{nc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{qc} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc}$$

$$\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc} \rightarrow \text{Noncircular PN factor (2PN accurate for model)}$$

$$P_{\ell m}^{\rm nc} \rightarrow \text{Noncircular PN factor}$$
 (2PN accurate for now)

Internal structure:

$$\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc} \equiv T_{2PN} \begin{bmatrix} \hat{h}_{\ell m} \\ \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{qc} \end{bmatrix} = 1 + \frac{1}{c^2} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{1PN_{inst,nc}} + \frac{1}{c^3} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{1.5PN_{tail,nc}} + \frac{1}{c^4} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{2PN_{inst,nc}}$$
Additional factorization
$$\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc} = \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc_{inst}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc_{inst}} = 1 + \frac{1}{c^2} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{1PN_{inst,nc}} + \frac{1}{c^4} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{2PN_{inst,nc}} - \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc_{tail}} \equiv 1 + \frac{1}{c^3} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{1.5PN_{tail,nc}}$$
We developed two versions of our extra factor:
$$\text{[Placidi et al. 2022, Albanesi et al. 04/2022]} \rightarrow \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc} [1]$$
Difference in the computation of the instantaneous factor $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc_{inst}}$

• [Albanesi et al. 06/2022]
$$\rightarrow \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc}[2]$$

17

Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



The two version of our factors



In terms of their **symmetric trace** free (STF) counterparts $L \equiv i_1, ..., i_\ell$ In terms of the STF multipoles of the source

$$\begin{array}{c} \begin{array}{c} \text{even} \\ \ell + m \end{array} \rightarrow & h_{\ell m} = -\frac{U_{\ell m}}{\sqrt{2} \ c^{\ell + 2}} \end{array} \\ \hline \\ \begin{array}{c} \text{odd} \\ \ell + m \end{array} \rightarrow & h_{\ell m} = i \frac{V_{\ell m}}{\sqrt{2} \ c^{\ell + 3}} \end{array} \end{array}$$

$$U_{\ell m} = \frac{4}{\ell!} \sqrt{\frac{(\ell+1)(\ell+2)}{2\ell(\ell+1)}} \alpha_{\ell m}^{L} U_{L} \rightarrow U_{L} = \frac{d^{\ell}}{dt^{\ell}} I_{L} + O(c^{-3})$$

$$V_{\ell m} = -\frac{8}{\ell!} \sqrt{\frac{\ell(\ell+2)}{2(\ell-1)(\ell+1)}} \alpha_{\ell m}^{L} V_{L} \rightarrow V_{L} = \frac{d^{\ell}}{dt^{\ell}} J_{L} + O(c^{-3})$$

Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



The two version of our factors



Two versions of our noncircular PN factors:

- $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc}[1] \rightarrow All$ the time derivatives of the EOB variables are removed using the 2PN-expanded equations of motion
- $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm nc}[2] \rightarrow \ln$ the instantaneous part we keep them explicit $\rightarrow \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm nc}$ is a PN generalization of $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{N_{\rm nc}}$



The two version of our factors



Two versions of our noncircular PN factors:

- $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc}[1] \rightarrow All$ the time derivatives of the EOB variables are removed using the 2PN-expanded equations of motion
- $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm nc}[2] \rightarrow \text{In the instantaneous part we keep them explicit} \rightarrow \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm nc}$ is a PN generalization of $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{N_{\rm nc}}$

Example - Instantaneous noncircular PN factor for the mode h_{22} :

Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



Waveform results [1]: test-mass limit



Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023



Waveform results [1]: test-mass limit



20



Waveform results [1]: test-mass limit



20



Waveform results [2]: test-mass limit

Simple testing ground: GW of a test-mass plunging on a black hole ($\nu \rightarrow 0$)

Ŵ

1950



Models:

$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{\rm qc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{N_{\rm nc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm qc}$$
$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{\rm qc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{N_{\rm nc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm qc} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm nc} [1]$$
$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{\rm qc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{N_{\rm nc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm qc} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm nc} [2]$$



Waveform results [2]: test-mass limit

1950

Simple testing ground: GW of a test-mass plunging on a black hole ($\nu \rightarrow 0$)



Models:

$$N \rightarrow h_{\ell r}$$

•
$$2PN[1] \rightarrow$$

$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{\rm qc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{N_{\rm nc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm qc}$$

$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{\rm qc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{N_{\rm nc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm qc} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm nc} [1]$$

$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{\rm qc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{N_{\rm nc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm qc} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm nc} [2]$$

 $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm nc}[1]$ and $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm nc}[2]$ give similar phase corrections but $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm nc}[2]$ also yields a small but significant improvement at the level of the amplitude


Waveform results [2]: test-mass limit

Simple testing ground: GW of a test-mass plunging on a black hole ($\nu \rightarrow 0$)



Models:

$$N \rightarrow h_{\ell m} =$$

$$2PN[1] \rightarrow h_{\ell m} =$$

$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{\rm qc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{N_{\rm nc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm qc}$$

$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{\rm qc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{N_{\rm nc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm qc} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm nc} [1]$$

$$h_{\ell m} = h_{\ell m}^{N_{\rm qc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{N_{\rm nc}} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm qc} \hat{h}_{\ell m}^{\rm nc} [2]$$

► $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc}[1]$ and $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc}[2]$ give similar phase corrections but $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc}[2]$ also yields a small but significant improvement at the level of the amplitude

Qualitative difference in the amplitude corrections [1] and [2]:



As opposed to $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc}[1]$, $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc}[2]$ brings amplitude corrections that do not vanish at the apastra and periastra (vertical lines in the plot) of the orbital motion

Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023

Andrea Placidi



Flux results for the geodesic motion [1]-[2]

Analytical/numerical relative differences averaged over a geodesic orbit with p=9



22

Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023

Andrea Placidi



Waveform results [1]-[2]: comparable masses

Comparisons with the waveforms of the Simulating eXtreme Spacetime (SXS) catalog [Placidi et al. 2021]: **EOB/NR unfaithfulness analysis** for the model with $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc}$ [1]



[Albanesi et al. 06/2022]: still no unfaithfulness analysis for the $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc}[2]$ model but we checked that the additional improvement over $\hat{h}_{\ell m}^{nc}[1]$ seen in the test-mass limit carries over to the comparable mass case, where the **amplitude corrections** at the radial turning points are **even more relevant**

Florence Theory Group Day - 22/02/2023

Andrea Placidi



EOB approach for more general dynamics Aligned/antialigned spins: $r_c \equiv \text{centrifugal radius}$

• $H_{\text{eff}} \rightarrow H_{\text{eff}}|_{r \rightarrow r_c}$ + spin-orbit terms • $A(r) \rightarrow A(r_c) \frac{1 + 2M/r_c}{1 + 2M/r}, \quad D(r) \rightarrow D(r_c) \frac{r^2}{r_c^2}$

• $\rho_{\ell m} \rightarrow \rho_{\ell m}^{\text{orb}} \rho_{\ell m}^{\text{spin}}$

Tidal deformations (Neutron stars):

•
$$A(r) \rightarrow A(r) + A_{\text{tidal}}^{\text{5PN}}(r, k_{\lambda})$$

Precession

Euler rotating aligned-spin (non-precessing) waveforms from a

precessing frame to an inertial frame



Eccentricity *e* and semilatus rectum *p*

There is no gauge invariant definition, we define them in analogy with Newtonian mechanics as:

$$r(\varphi) = \frac{p}{1 - e \cos \varphi}, \quad \rightarrow \quad r_p = \frac{p}{1 + e}, \quad r_a = \frac{p}{1 - e}$$
$$\rightarrow \quad e = \frac{r_a - r_p}{r_a + r_p}, \quad p = \frac{2r_a r_p}{r_a + r_p}$$

where the numerical values of periastron and apastron (r_p, r_a) follows from Hamilton's equations of motion in terms of the EOB Hamiltonian

Notice: this definition is valid as long as bound orbits are considered