## Topological phases of matter: from bulk model wave functions to the edge theory

J. Dubail (Yale)

Joint work with N. Read and E. Rezayi

GGI - Florence - April 18, 2012

"topological phase"  $\leftrightarrow$  gapped phase  $E_{exc.} > 0$  (massive) "topological" quantity = invariant as long as  $E_{exc.} > 0$ 

#### Examples (electronic):



BCS theory (Bardeen-Cooper-Schrieffer) of superconductivity:

$$\hat{H} = \sum_{\mathbf{k}} \left[ \frac{\mathbf{k}^2}{2m} c_{\mathbf{k}}^{\dagger} c_{\mathbf{k}} + \frac{1}{2} \left( \overline{\Delta}_{\mathbf{k}} c_{-\mathbf{k}} c_{\mathbf{k}} + \Delta_{\mathbf{k}} c_{\mathbf{k}}^{\dagger} c_{-\mathbf{k}}^{\dagger} \right) \right]$$

chemical potential  $\mu$ :

$$\hat{H} 
ightarrow \hat{H} - \mu \hat{N} = \hat{H} - \mu \sum_{\mathbf{k}} c_{k}^{\dagger} c_{k}$$

in 2D, with T et P broken:

$$\Delta_{f k}\sim \Delta_0(k_x-ik_y)$$

$$\begin{split} \Delta_{\mathbf{k}} \sim \Delta_{0}(k_{x} - ik_{y}) & (``p_{x} + ip_{y}'' \text{ superconductivity}) \\ \text{ground state:} \quad |\psi\rangle \ = \ e^{\frac{1}{2}\sum_{\mathbf{k}} \ g(\mathbf{k}) \ c_{\mathbf{k}}^{\dagger} c_{-\mathbf{k}}^{\dagger}} \left|0\right\rangle \end{split}$$

$$\begin{array}{rcl} S^2 \simeq \mathbb{C} \cup \{\infty\} & \longrightarrow & \mathbb{C} \cup \{\infty\} \simeq S^2 \\ \mathbf{k} & \longmapsto & g(\mathbf{k}) \end{array}$$



$$\Delta_{f k}\sim \Delta_0(k_x-ik_y)$$

$$("p_x + ip_y"$$
 superconductivity)

topological excitation: vortex



vortices and non-abelian statistics [Read and Green, 2000]



- same physics in the FQHE at ν = <sup>5</sup>/<sub>2</sub> [Moore and Read, 1991]
   → possible experimental observation (interferometry)
- topologically protected qubits [Kitaev, 1997]

Topologically non-trivial phases:

free particles + topology

(topological insulators+superconductors)

quadratic Hamiltonian +topology (+perturbations)

→ well-known methods are available

interacting particles

(FQHE, ???)

 $\longrightarrow$  requires new methods

difficult problem



privileged method (at least for FQHE):

model wave function

ground state + excitations

[Laughlin 1983]

 $\longrightarrow$  a powerful method: "Moore-Read construction"

$$\Delta_{\mathbf{k}} \sim \Delta_0(k_x - ik_y)$$
 (" $p_x + ip_y$ " superconductivity)  
ground state:  $|\psi\rangle = e^{\frac{1}{2}\int d^2z_1 \int d^2z_2 g(z_1, z_2) c^{\dagger}(z_1) c^{\dagger}(z_2)} |0\rangle$ 



$$egin{aligned} \Delta_{\mathbf{k}} &\sim \Delta_0(k_x - ik_y) \end{aligned}$$
 (" $p_x + ip_y$ " superconductivity) ground state:  $|\psi
angle &= e^{rac{1}{2}\int d^2 z_1 \int d^2 z_2 \; g(z_1, z_2) \, c^{\dagger}(z_1) c^{\dagger}(z_2)} \left|0
ight
angle \end{aligned}$ 





 $\psi_{\text{vortex}}(w_1, w_2, w_3, w_4, z_1, ..., z_N) \\ = \langle \sigma(w_1) \sigma(w_2) \sigma(w_3) \sigma(w_4) \varepsilon(z_1) ... \varepsilon(z_N) \rangle_{\text{Ising}}$ 

local magnetization in the Ising CFT:

 $\sigma(w,\overline{w}) = \sigma(w) \times \overline{\sigma(w)}$ 

correspondence local operators (CFT)  $\leftrightarrow$  topological excitations



## Moore-Read construction: what about the edge excitations?



## Moore-Read construction: what about the edge excitations?



gapless edge excitations described by a 1+1d CFT

Moore-Read construction: what about the edge excitations?



- ▶ a simple example:  $p_x + ip_y$ , massive Ising and edge theory
- FQHE, conformal blocks and screening hypothesis
- application to the entanglement spectrum



$$|\psi\rangle
angle = rac{1}{\sqrt{Z}}\exp\left(\int d^2w_1\int d^2w_2 \ g(w_1,w_2) \ c^+_{w_1}c^+_{w_2}
ight)|0
angle
angle$$

where w = x + iy

$$g(w_1, w_2) = \frac{\mu}{\frac{L}{2\pi}\sinh\left(2\pi\frac{w_1 - w_2}{L}\right)}$$

 $\mu$  is an inverse length, related to the density



where w = x + iy

$$g(w_1, w_2) = \mu \langle \Psi(w_1)\Psi(w_2) \rangle$$

 $\Psi(w)$  is a free (Majorana) fermion field



$$|\psi
angle
angle \ = \ rac{1}{\sqrt{Z}} \left\langle \exp\left(\sqrt{\mu}\int d^2 w \ \Psi(w) \ c^+_w
ight)
ight
angle |0
angle
angle$$

where w = x + iy

$$\langle \Psi(w_1)\Psi(w_2)
angle = rac{1}{rac{L}{2\pi}\sinh\left(2\pirac{w_1-w_2}{L}
ight)}$$

is the fermion propagator (then use Wick's theorem)



Now look at the norm of  $|\,\psi\rangle\rangle$ 

$$1 = \langle \langle \psi | \psi \rangle \rangle$$
  
=  $\frac{1}{Z} \langle \langle 0 | \langle e^{\sqrt{\mu} \int d^2 w \, \overline{\Psi(w)} \, c_w} e^{\sqrt{\mu} \int d^2 w \, \Psi(w) \, c_w^+} \rangle | 0 \rangle \rangle$   
=  $\frac{1}{Z} \langle e^{\mu \int d^2 w \, \Psi(w) \overline{\Psi(w)}} \rangle$ 



$$Z = \left\langle e^{\mu \int d^2 w \, \Psi(w) \overline{\Psi(w)}} \right\rangle$$

note that  $\mu$  is the mass is the action

$$S = \int d^2 w \left[ \Psi \partial_{\overline{w}} \Psi + \overline{\Psi} \partial_w \overline{\Psi} + \mu \, \Psi \overline{\Psi} \right]$$



Model wave function for the edge excitations:

$$|\psi, w_1, w_2 \rangle \rangle = \frac{1}{\sqrt{Z}} \left\langle \psi(w_1) \psi(w_2) \exp\left(\sqrt{\mu} \int d^2 w \psi(w) c^+(w)\right) \right\rangle |0\rangle \rangle$$



Model wave function for the edge excitations:

$$|\psi, w_1, w_2\rangle\rangle = \frac{1}{\sqrt{Z}} \left\langle \psi(w_1)\psi(w_2) \exp\left(\sqrt{\mu}\int d^2w\psi(w)c^+(w)\right) \right\rangle |0\rangle\rangle$$

Question: what's the overlap between two edge states?

$$\langle \langle \psi | \psi, w_1, w_2 \rangle \rangle = ? \quad \langle \langle \psi, w_1 | \psi, w_2 \rangle \rangle = ? , etc.$$



Question: what's the propagator in the massless phase?

$$\langle \Psi(w_1)\Psi(w_2)\rangle = \left\langle \Psi(w_1)\overline{\Psi(w_2)} \right\rangle = \left\langle \overline{\Psi(w_1)}\,\overline{\Psi(w_2)} \right\rangle$$



Answer when  $\mu \to \infty$ :

$$\left\langle \Psi(w_1)\overline{\Psi(w_2)}
ight
angle = \left\langle \Psi(x_1,y_1)\Psi(-x_2,y_2)
ight
angle$$

corresponding to the conformal boundary condition

$$\Psi(0,y) = \overline{\Psi}(0,y) \qquad (x=0)$$



Answer at finite  $\mu$ :

$$\left\langle \Psi(w_1)\overline{\Psi(w_2)}\right\rangle = \left\langle \Psi(x_1, y_1) \ e^{-S_{pert}(\mu)} \ \Psi(-x_2, y_2)\right\rangle$$

corresponding to a perturbed conformal boundary condition

$$S_{\text{pert}} = \lambda \int_0^L dy \, \phi(0, y) + \dots$$

Conclusion for  $p_x + ip_y$ 

- Edge excitations natural in the MR construction
- Overlaps between edge excitations
   massive/massless interface in the 2d Ising model

FQHE, screening and the edge theory

FQHE: trial wave functions as conformal blocks

N particles in the LLL

 $\psi(z_1,\ldots,z_N)$ 

analytic in the  $z_i$ 's, and antisymetric (Fermi statistics)

Moore-Read: trial wave function given by conformal block

$$\psi(z_1,\ldots,z_N) = \langle a(z_N)\ldots a(z_1) \rangle$$

$$a(z_1) a(z_2) a(z_3) a(z_4) a(z_4)$$

Screening hypothesis (I)

$$Z_N = \frac{1}{N!} \int_{\mathbb{C}^N} \prod_{i=1}^N e^{V(z_i, \bar{z}_i)} d^2 z_i |\psi(z_1, \dots, z_N)|^2$$

 $|\psi(z_1,\ldots,z_N)|^2 = \langle a(z_1)\ldots a(z_N) \rangle \times \langle \overline{a}(\overline{z}_1)\ldots \overline{a}(\overline{z}_N) \rangle$ 



Screening hypothesis (II)

$$Z_{N} = \frac{1}{N!} \int \prod e^{V(z_{i}, \bar{z}_{i})} d^{2}z_{i} \quad \langle a(z_{1}) \dots a(z_{N}) \rangle \times \langle \bar{a}(\bar{z}_{1}) \dots \bar{a}(\bar{z}_{N}) \rangle$$
Screening
$$a(z_{i}) \otimes \bar{a}(\bar{z}_{i})$$

$$a(z_{i}) \otimes \bar{a}(\bar{z}_{i})$$

$$a(z_{i}) \otimes \bar{a}(\bar{z}_{i})$$

$$a(z_{i}) \otimes \bar{a}(\bar{z}_{i})$$

short-range correl. only

some long-range correl.  $\Rightarrow$  NOT a gapped phase of matter

## Screening hypothesis (III)

- ► thermodynamic limit N → ∞, rescale the droplet to keep radius fixed (say radius=1)
- at the boundary of the droplet (|z| = 1), screening implies

 $a(z) = \bar{a}^{\dagger}(\bar{z}) \times \text{phase factor}$ 



## Screening hypothesis (III)

- ► thermodynamic limit N → ∞, rescale the droplet to keep radius fixed (say radius=1)
- at the boundary of the droplet (|z| = 1), screening implies

 $a(z) = \bar{a}^{\dagger}(\bar{z}) \times \text{phase factor}$ 



## Screening hypothesis (III)

- ► thermodynamic limit N → ∞, rescale the droplet to keep radius fixed (say radius=1)
- at the boundary of the droplet (|z| = 1), screening implies

 $a(z) = \bar{a}^{\dagger}(\bar{z}) \times \text{phase factor}$ 



 conformal mapping z → w(z) from the exterior of the droplet to the cylinder: a(w) = ā<sup>†</sup>(w)

#### Edge states (I)

Reminder: the ground state w.f. is defined as

$$\psi_{g.s}(z_1,\ldots,z_N) = \langle a(z_1)\ldots a(z_N) \rangle$$

▶ to construct the edge states w.f., we insert contour integrals

$$\left\langle \oint w_1^{n_1} \phi(w_1) dw_1 \dots \oint w_k^{n_k} \phi(w_k) dw_k \ a(z_1) \dots a(z_N) \right\rangle$$

 $\phi_j(w_j)$  is in the chiral algebra generated by a(w),  $a^{\dagger}(w)$ 



## Edge states (I)

Reminder: the ground state w.f. is defined as

$$\psi_{g.s}(z_1,\ldots,z_N) = \langle a(z_1)\ldots a(z_N) \rangle$$

in other words (radial quantization):





## Edge states (I)

Reminder: the ground state w.f. is defined as

$$\psi_{g.s}(z_1,\ldots,z_N) = \langle a(z_1)\ldots a(z_N) \rangle$$

in other words (radial quantization):

 $\begin{array}{ccc} (\textit{dual}) \textit{ CFT Hilbert sp.} & \longrightarrow & \textit{edge theory Hilbert sp.} \\ & \langle v | & \longmapsto & \psi_{\langle v |} = \langle v \, | \, a(z_1) \dots a(z_N) | \, 0 \rangle \end{array}$ 

 straightforward generalization of the previous constructions of edge states for specific w.f. an example (Laughlin):

$$\psi_{\langle J_{n_1}J_{n_2}|}(\{z_i\}) \propto \sum_i z_i^{n_1} \sum_j z_j^{n_2} \times \prod_{k < l} (z_k - z_l)^{1/\nu}$$

## Edge states (II)

quantum-mechanical inner product

$$\left\langle \left\langle \psi_{\langle \mathbf{v}_{1} |} \left| \psi_{\langle \mathbf{v}_{2} |} \right\rangle \right\rangle = \frac{1}{Z_{N} N!} \int_{\mathbb{C}^{N}} \prod_{i=1}^{N} e^{V} d^{2} z_{i} \left[ \psi_{\langle \mathbf{v}_{1} |}(\{z_{i}\}) \right]^{*} \psi_{\langle \mathbf{v}_{2} |}(\{z_{i}\})$$



## Edge states (II)

quantum-mechanical inner product

$$\left\langle \left\langle \psi_{\langle \mathbf{v}_{1} |} \left| \psi_{\langle \mathbf{v}_{2} |} \right\rangle \right\rangle = \frac{1}{Z_{N} N!} \int_{\mathbb{C}^{N}} \prod_{i=1}^{N} e^{V} d^{2} z_{i} \left[ \psi_{\langle \mathbf{v}_{1} |}(\{z_{i}\}) \right]^{*} \psi_{\langle \mathbf{v}_{2} |}(\{z_{i}\})$$



► Consequence:  $\langle \langle \psi_{\langle \mathbf{v}_1 |} | \psi_{\langle \mathbf{v}_2 |} \rangle \rangle = \langle \mathbf{v}_2 | \mathbf{v}_1 \rangle$  when  $N \to \infty$ .

## Bulk/edge correspondence

Screening implies that

 $\begin{array}{ccc} (\textit{dual}) \ \textit{CFT Hilbert sp.} & \longrightarrow & \textit{edge theory Hilbert sp.} \\ \textit{inner product } \langle . \, | . \rangle & & \textit{inner product } \langle \langle . \, | . \rangle \rangle \\ \\ \langle v | & \longmapsto & \psi_{\langle v |} = \langle v \, | \textit{a}(z_1) \dots \textit{a}(z_N) | \, 0 \rangle \end{array}$ 

is a Hilbert sp. isomorphism in the thermodynamic limit  $N \to \infty$ :

$$\langle \langle \psi_{\langle \mathbf{v}_1 |} | \psi_{\langle \mathbf{v}_2 |} \rangle \rangle = \langle \mathbf{v}_2 | \mathbf{v}_1 \rangle$$

(for the Laughlin w.f., similar argument appeared first in [Wen, 1992])

Entanglement spectrum: what are we talking about?

Entanglement spectrum: what are we talking about?

Starting point:

quantum many-body systems: different phases matter

$$|g.s.1\rangle = |\cdots \otimes \Uparrow \otimes \Uparrow \otimes \Uparrow \otimes \Uparrow \otimes \dotsb \rangle$$
$$|g.s.2\rangle = |\cdots \qquad \textcircled{\bullet} \qquad \textcircled{\bullet} \qquad \textcircled{\bullet} \qquad \textcircled{\bullet} \qquad \swarrow \qquad \checkmark$$

- some phases are "very entangled", some are "less entangled"
- study entanglement in the g.s. and use it as (theoretical/numerical) diagnostic tool

Entanglement spectrum: what are we talking about?

A

$$|\psi\rangle \in \mathcal{H} = \mathcal{H}_{\mathcal{A}} \otimes \mathcal{H}_{\mathcal{B}}$$



$$H |\psi\rangle = 0$$

Schmidt decomposition:

$$\begin{split} |\psi\rangle &= \sum_{k=1}^{r} e^{-\xi_{k}/2} |k\rangle_{A} \otimes |k\rangle_{B} \\ {}_{A} \langle k|k'\rangle_{A} &= {}_{B} \langle k,k'\rangle_{B} = \delta_{k,k'} \\ r &\leq \min(\dim\mathcal{H}_{A},\dim\mathcal{H}_{B}) \end{split}$$

 $\{\xi_k\}$  is the entanglement spectrum

Physical scenario (part of [Qi, Katsura, Ludwig, 2011])

- gapped bulk
- gapless, chiral edge modes



$$H = H_A + H_B$$

Physical scenario (part of [Qi, Katsura, Ludwig, 2011])

- gapped bulk
- gapless, chiral edge modes



- $H = H_A + H_B + H_{AB}$
- ► rotational invariance:  $\begin{bmatrix} H_{AB}, L_{\hat{z}}^{A} + L_{\hat{z}}^{B} \end{bmatrix} = \\
  \begin{bmatrix} H_{A}, L_{\hat{z}}^{A} \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} H_{B}, L_{\hat{z}}^{B} \end{bmatrix} = 0$

plot the ES vs. angular momentum  $L^A_{a}$ "level counting": in each  $L_2^A$ subsector  $\#\{\xi_k(L_{\hat{z}}^A)\} \leq \dim \mathcal{H}_{\Delta I^A}^{edge}$ 

(by construction)

- relation between counting of Schmidt eigenvalues and edge states conjectured by [Li and Haldane, 2008]
- coined the term "entanglement spectrum", and proposed it as a numerical diagnostic tool



anticipated in the last few lines of [Kitaev and Preskill, 2006]

... in summary:

cut/glue argument  
(edge only)trial wave-functions  
(bulk 
$$\rightarrow$$
 edge)real-life system  
(complicated) $\psi(z_1, \ldots, z_N)$  $\psi(z_1, \ldots, z_N)$  $\psi(z_1, \ldots, z_N)$ 

... in summary:



# ES in quantum Hall systems ... in summary:

cut/glue argument (edge only)





 $\begin{array}{l} \mbox{trial wave-functions} \\ \mbox{(bulk} \rightarrow \mbox{edge)} \end{array}$ 

$$\psi(z_1,\ldots,z_N)$$

real-life system (complicated)



# ES in quantum Hall systems ... in summary:

cut/glue argument (edge only)





trial wave-functions (bulk  $\rightarrow$  edge)

$$\psi(z_1,\ldots,z_N)$$



real-life system (complicated)





• what's the Schmidt decomp. of  $\psi_{g.s}(z_1, \ldots, z_N)$  ?

$$|\psi_{g.s}\rangle\rangle = \sum_{N_A=0}^{N} \sum_{n} e^{-\xi_n/2} \left|\psi_n^A\right\rangle\rangle \otimes \left|\psi_n^B\right\rangle\rangle$$



we focus on Real Space Partition

• divide the  $N = N_A + N_B$  coordinates  $z_i$ 's into two sets

$$z_1,\ldots,z_{N_A}$$
  $w_1=z_{N_A+1},\ldots,w_{N_B}=z_{N_A+N_B}$ 

• because  $\psi_{g.s}$  is a conformal correlator, one has

$$\begin{split} \psi_{g.s}(\{z_j\}, \{w_k\}) &= \langle a(z_1) ... a(z_{N_A}) a(w_1) ... a(w_{N_B}) \rangle \\ &= \sum_{|v_n\rangle} \langle a(z_1) ... a(z_{N_A}) | v_n \rangle \langle v_n | a(w_1) ... a(w_{N_B}) \rangle \\ &= \sum_{|v_n\rangle} \psi_{\langle v_n |}(\{z_j\}) \tilde{\psi}_{\langle v_n |}(\{w_k\}) \end{split}$$

• divide the  $N = N_A + N_B$  coordinates  $z_i$ 's into two sets

$$z_1, \ldots, z_{N_A}$$
  $w_1 = z_{N_A+1}, \ldots, w_{N_B} = z_{N_A+N_B}$ 

• because  $\psi_{g,s}$  is a conformal correlator, one has



• divide the  $N = N_A + N_B$  coordinates  $z_i$ 's into two sets

$$z_1,\ldots,z_{N_A}$$
  $w_1=z_{N_A+1},\ldots,w_{N_B}=z_{N_A+N_B}$ 

• because  $\psi_{g.s}$  is a conformal correlator, one has

$$\begin{split} \psi_{g.s}(\{z_j\}, \{w_k\}) &= \langle a(z_1) ... a(z_{N_A}) a(w_1) ... a(w_{N_B}) \rangle \\ &= \sum_{|v_n\rangle} \langle a(z_1) ... a(z_{N_A}) | v_n \rangle \langle v_n | a(w_1) ... a(w_{N_B}) \rangle \\ &= \sum_{|v_n\rangle} \psi_{\langle v_n |}(\{z_j\}) \tilde{\psi}_{\langle v_n |}(\{w_k\}) \end{split}$$

we get the entanglement spectrum using the overlaps

$$\langle \langle \psi_{\langle \mathbf{v}_n |} | \psi_{\langle \mathbf{v}_m |} \rangle \rangle = \langle \mathbf{v}_m | \mathbf{v}_n \rangle + O(1/\sqrt{N})$$

Result: the entanglement spectrum is given by

$$\xi(\Delta N_A, \Delta L_{\hat{z}}^A) = \alpha R - \gamma_{\text{topo}} + O(1/R)$$

in other words, the spectrum is infinitely degenerate (!!!) up to O(1/R) corrections

Result: the entanglement spectrum is given by

$$\xi(\Delta N_A, \Delta L_{\hat{z}}^A) = \alpha R - \gamma_{topo} + O(1/R)$$



more seriously...

#### Overlaps beyond the leading order

finite N effects captured by a perturbation of the CFT action at the boundary of the droplet

$$S_b = \sum_a \lambda_a \int_{|z|=R} \phi_a(z) |dz|$$

•  $\phi_a$  has scaling dimension  $h_a \Rightarrow \lambda_a \sim (\frac{1}{\sqrt{N}})^{h_a - 1}$ 

the overlaps become

$$\left\langle \left\langle \psi_{\langle \mathbf{v}_1 |} \left| \psi_{\langle \mathbf{v}_2 |} \right\rangle \right\rangle \ = \ \left\langle \mathbf{v}_2 \right| \frac{e^{-S_b}}{\langle e^{-S_b} \rangle} \left| \mathbf{v}_1 \right\rangle$$

▶ in many cases, the stress-tensor T(z) is the least irrelevant boundary perturbation

$$\Rightarrow \langle \langle \psi_{\langle \mathbf{v}_1 |} | \psi_{\langle \mathbf{v}_2 |} \rangle \rangle = \langle \mathbf{v}_2 | e^{-\frac{const.}{\sqrt{N}}L_0} | \mathbf{v}_1 \rangle + O(1/N)$$

This proves the so-called "scaling property" [JD-Read-Rezayi 2012]

the entanglement spectrum is the spectrum of the Hamiltonian of a 1+1d CFT perturbed by local operators  $H_{ES} = \alpha R - \gamma_{topo} + \frac{v_F}{R} L_0 + \sum \lambda_a \int_{|z|=R} \phi_a(z) |dz|$ 

#### locality of the entanglement Hamiltonian



### Summary

- provided screening, we are left with a CFT outside the droplet with a (perturbed) conformal boundary condition
- $\blacktriangleright$  allows to compute overlaps between edge states when  $N \rightarrow \infty$

$$\left\langle \left\langle \psi_{\left\langle \mathbf{v}_{1}\right|} \mid \psi_{\left\langle \mathbf{v}_{2}\right|} \right\rangle \right\rangle \xrightarrow[N \to \infty]{} \left\langle \mathbf{v}_{2} \mid \mathbf{v}_{1} \right\rangle$$

- precise formulation of the bulk/boundary correspondence: isomorphism between bulk CFT/edge theory Hilbert spaces
- proof of the locality of the entanglement Hamiltonian

Thank you.