# Competing phases in frustrated ferromagnetic spin chain

Only ground-state phase diagram No quantum quench, ....

# Akira Furusaki (RIKEN)

Collaborators: Shunsuke Furukawa (U. Tokyo) Shigeki Onoda (RIKEN) Masahiro Sato (Aoyama Gakuin U.)



# Outline

- 1. Introduction: frustrated spin- $1/2 J_1 J_2 XXZ$  chain
- 2. Phase diagram of  $J_1$ - $J_2$  XXZ spin chain ( $J_2$  is antiferromagnetic)
  - a.  $J_1 > 0$  (antiferromagnetic) review
  - b. J<sub>1</sub><0 (ferromagnetic) new results

# frustrated spin-1/2 XXZ chain

$$H = \sum_{n=1,2} \sum_{j} J_n \left( S_j^x S_{j+n}^x + S_j^y S_{j+n}^y + \Delta S_j^z S_{j+n}^z \right)$$
  
easy-plane anisotropy  $0 \le \Delta \le 1$   
 $J_1$   
 $J_2 > 0(AF)$   
 $J_2 > 0(AF)$ 

If  $J_2$  is antiferromagnetic, spins are frustrated regardless of the sign of  $J_1$ .

 $J_1$ - $J_2$  spin chain is the simplest spin model with frustration.



# Quasi-1D spin-1/2 frustrated magnets with ferro J<sub>1</sub>



#### Model

Frustrated spin-1/2  $J_1$ - $J_2$  XXZ chain

$$H = \sum_{m=1,2} \sum_{j} J_m (S_j^x S_{j+m}^x + S_j^y S_{j+m}^y + \Delta S_j^z S_{j+m}^z)$$

easy-plane anisotropy  $0 < \Delta < 1$ 

Spins are frustrated when  $J_2>0$ , irrespective of the sign of  $J_1$ .



<u>Classical ground state</u>  $(0 \le \Delta \le 1)$ 



# Quantum case S=1/2

> Classical spiral (chiral) order is destroyed by strong quantum fluctuations in 1D.

> Antiferromagnetic case  $(J_1>0, J_2>0)$  is well understood.

- Singlet dimer order is stabilized  $(J_2/J_1>0.24)$ .

Haldane, PRB1982 Nomura & Okamoto, J.Phys.A 1994 White & Affleck, PRB 1996 Eggert, PRB 1996



- Vector chiral order (quantum remnant of the spiral phase) is found for small  $J_1/J_2 < 0.8$ ,  $\Delta < 0.2$  Nersesyan,Gogolin,& Essler, PRL 1998 Hikihara,Kaburagi,& Kawamura, PRB 2001

$$\left(\vec{S}_{j} \times \vec{S}_{j+1}\right)_{z}$$
 LRO

Quantum analogue of spiral state



## Quantum case S=1/2

> The ferromagnetic- $J_1$  case ( $J_1 < 0, J_2 > 0$ ) not well understood

-Stability of the vector chiral order ? (crucial in understanding the emergence of multiferroicity)

- Any other novel quantum phases arising from frustration?

#### Our work: the ground-state phase diagram for $J_1 < 0$ .

Method:

- numerics:
  - ✓ time evolving block decimation for infinite system (iTEBD)
  - ✓ exact diagonalization
- perturbative RG analysis around  $J_1=0$  or  $J_2=0$ .

Symmetry broken state can be studied. Order parameter can be measured.

# antiferromagnetic J<sub>1</sub>: brief review



# XXZ spin chain

$$H = J_1 \sum_{j} \left( S_j^{x} S_{j+1}^{x} + S_j^{y} S_{j+1}^{y} + \Delta S_j^{z} S_{j+1}^{z} \right)$$

• Exactly solvable: Bethe ansatz gapless phase  $-1 < \Delta \leq 1$ 



Effective field theory: bosonization

$$H_{\rm eff} = \frac{v}{2} \int dx \left[ K \left( \partial_x \theta \right)^2 + \frac{1}{K} \left( \partial_x \phi \right)^2 - \lambda \cos \left( \sqrt{8\pi} \phi \right) \right]$$

 $\phi(x), \theta(x)$ : bosonic field  $\left[\phi(x), \partial_y \theta(y)\right] = i\delta(x-y)$ 

$$\cos\left(\sqrt{8\pi}\phi\right) \text{ is } - \left\{\begin{array}{c} \text{relevant for } |\Delta| > 1\\ \text{irrelevant for } |\Delta| < 1\\ \text{marginally irrelevant for } \Delta = 1\end{array}\right.$$
For  $|\Delta| \le 1$ 

$$\Delta = -\cos\left(\frac{\pi}{K}\right): \quad K = 2 \text{ at } \Delta = 0, \quad K = 1 \text{ at } \Delta = 1$$

 $v = \frac{\sin(\pi \eta)}{2(1-\eta)} \qquad \qquad \eta = \frac{1}{K} = 1 - \frac{1}{\pi} \cos^{-1} \Delta$ 

• In the critical phase  $-1 < \Delta \le 1$ 

The cosine term is irrelevant in the low-energy limit

$$\tilde{H} = \frac{v}{2} \int dx \left[ K \left( \partial_x \theta \right)^2 + \frac{1}{K} \left( \partial_x \phi \right)^2 \right] : \text{Gaussian model}$$

$$\phi(x), \theta(x)$$
: bosonic scalar field  $\left[\phi(x), \partial_y \theta(y)\right] = i\delta(x-y)$   
 $\eta = \frac{1}{K}$ 

 $\eta = 1$  at  $\Delta = 1$ 

 NN bond (energy) operators  $O_e^{\pm}(l) = \frac{1}{4} \left( S_l^+ S_{l+1}^- + S_l^- S_{l+1}^+ \right), \qquad O_e^z(l) = S_l^z S_{l+1}^z$  $O_e^{\alpha}(l) = c_0^{\alpha} + c_1^{\alpha} \left(-1\right)^l \sin\left[\sqrt{2\pi}\phi(x_l)\right] + c_{\phi}^{\alpha} \left(\partial_x \phi(x_l)\right)^2 + c_{\theta}^{\alpha} \left(\partial_x \theta(x_l)\right)^2 + \cdots$ 



dimer phase 
$$\langle \vec{S}_{j} \cdot \vec{S}_{j+1} - \vec{S}_{j+1} \cdot \vec{S}_{j+2} \rangle \neq 0$$
  
 $\vec{S}_{j} \cdot \vec{S}_{j+1} = c_{0}^{\alpha} + c_{1}^{\alpha} (-1)^{l} \sin \left[ \sqrt{2\pi} \phi(x_{l}) \right] + \cdots$  Haldane '82  
White & Affleck '96  
 $H_{\text{eff}} = \frac{v}{2} \int dx \left[ K (\partial_{x} \theta)^{2} + \frac{1}{K} (\partial_{x} \phi)^{2} - \lambda \cos \left( \sqrt{8\pi} \phi \right) \right]$   
 $J_{2} > 0 \text{ changes } \lambda \text{ (and scaling dimension of } \cos \left( \sqrt{8\pi} \phi \right) \text{)} \quad \lambda \propto J_{1} - cJ_{2}$   
If  $\cos \left( \sqrt{8\pi} \phi \right)$  is relevant and  $\lambda < 0$ ,  
then  $\phi(x)$  is pinned at  $\phi = +\sqrt{\pi/8} \text{ or } -\sqrt{\pi/8}$ .  $\langle \sin \left( \sqrt{2\pi} \phi \right) \rangle \neq 0$   
dimer LRO

If  $\cos(\sqrt{8\pi}\phi)$  is relevant and  $\lambda > 0$ ,  $\implies \langle \cos(\sqrt{2\pi}\phi) \rangle \neq 0$ then  $\phi(x)$  is pinned at  $\phi = 0$  or  $\sqrt{\pi/2}$ . Neel LRO





Perturbative RG at  $J_1 << J_2$ 

SU(2) symmetric case

Non-Abelian bosonization  $SU(2)_1$  WZW White & Affleck, PRB (1996)

$$\vec{S}_{1,j} = \vec{M}_1(x) + (-1)^j \vec{N}_1(x) \qquad \vec{S}_{2,j} = \vec{M}_2(x) + (-1)^j \vec{N}_2(x)$$
$$J_1 \sum_j \vec{S}_{1,j} \cdot \left(\vec{S}_{2,j} + \vec{S}_{2,j+1}\right) \to g_1 \int dx \left(\vec{M}_{1L} \cdot \vec{M}_{2R} + \vec{M}_{1R} \cdot \vec{M}_{2L}\right)$$

1-loop RG 
$$\frac{dg_1}{dl} = g_1^2$$
  $J_1 > 0$  marginally relevant  $\implies$  dimer order  $J_1 < 0$  marginally irrelevant  $\implies$  ???

Perturbative RG at  $J_1 << J_2$ 

XXZ case Nersesyan, Gogolin, & Essler, PRL (1998)

$$S_{\mu,l}^{+} = e^{i\sqrt{2\pi}\theta_{\mu}(l)} \left[ b_{0}(-1)^{l} + b_{1}\cos\left(\sqrt{2\pi}\phi_{\mu}(l)\right) + \cdots \right]$$

$$S_{\mu,l}^{z} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \partial_{x}\phi_{\mu}(l) - a_{1}(-1)^{l}\cos\left(\sqrt{2\pi}\phi_{\mu}(l)\right) + \cdots$$

$$J_{1}\left(S_{1,j}^{+} + S_{1,j+1}^{+}\right)S_{2,j}^{-} + \text{h.c.} \sim g_{1}\cos\left(\sqrt{4\pi}\phi_{+}\right)\cos\left(\sqrt{4\pi}\theta_{-}\right) + g_{2}\partial_{x}\theta_{+}\sin\left(\sqrt{4\pi}\theta_{-}\right)$$

$$\phi_{\pm} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(\phi_{1} \pm \phi_{2}), \quad \theta_{\pm} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(\theta_{1} \pm \theta_{2}) \quad \bigoplus_{\text{dimer order}} \text{vector chiral order}$$

$$J_{1}\left(S_{1,j}^{z} + S_{1,j+1}^{z}\right)S_{2,j}^{z} \sim J_{1}\left[\left(\partial_{x}\phi_{+}\right)^{2} - \left(\partial_{x}\phi_{-}\right)^{2}\right] \quad \text{scaling dimensions}$$

$$g_{1} \colon K_{\pm} + \frac{1}{K_{-}}$$

$$g_{2} \colon 1 + \frac{1}{K_{-}}$$

Vector chiral order is favored near  $\Delta = 0$ 

Vector chiral phase

p-type nematic Andreev-Grishchuk (1984)

When 
$$g_2 \frac{d\theta_+}{dx} \sin\left(\sqrt{2\pi}\theta_-\right)$$
 is relevant  $\rightarrow \left\langle \sin\left(\sqrt{2\pi}\theta_-\right) \right\rangle \neq 0, \left\langle \frac{d\theta_+}{dx} \right\rangle$ 

- Characteristics of the vector chiral state
  - Vector chiral order

$$\chi_l^{(1)} = \left\langle \left( \vec{s}_l \times \vec{s}_{l+1} \right)^z \right\rangle \sim -\left\langle \sin\left(\sqrt{2\pi}\theta_{-}\right) \right\rangle$$
$$\chi_l^{(2)} = \left\langle \left( \vec{s}_l \times \vec{s}_{l+2} \right)^z \right\rangle \sim -\left\langle \frac{d\theta_{+}}{dx} \right\rangle$$

*opposite sign*  $(\chi^{(1)}, \chi^{(2)}) = (+, -)$  or (-, +)

Vector chiral order  $\triangleleft \chi < 0$ 

Nersesyan-Gogolin-Essler (1998)

≠0



doubly degenerate ground state

#### S<sup>x</sup>S<sup>x</sup> & S<sup>x</sup>S<sup>y</sup> spin correlation

$$\left\langle s_0^x s_r^x \right\rangle \sim r^{-\frac{1}{4}K_+} \cos(qr) \quad \left\langle s_0^x s_r^y \right\rangle \sim \pm r^{-\frac{1}{4}K_+} \sin(qr)$$

power-law decay, incommensurate

A quantum counterpart of the classical helical state



# New Results for the J<sub>1</sub>-J<sub>2</sub> spin chain with ferromagnetic J<sub>1</sub>



Phase diagram & chiral order parameter  $\langle (\vec{S}_1 \times \vec{S}_2)^z \rangle$ 



The vector chiral phase is larger in the ferromagnetic  $J_1$  case and extends up to the vicinity of the isotropic case  $\Delta \approx 1$ .

Perturbation around 
$$J_1=0$$
  

$$H_{eff} = \sum_{\mu=1,2} \frac{\nu}{2} \int dx \left[ K \left( \partial_x \theta_\mu \right)^2 + \frac{1}{K} \left( \partial_x \phi_\mu \right)^2 + \lambda \cos\left(\sqrt{8\pi} \phi_\mu\right) \right]$$

$$S_{\mu,l}^+ = e^{i\sqrt{2\pi}\theta_\mu(l)} \left[ b_0(-1)^l + b_1 \cos\left(\sqrt{2\pi}\phi_\mu(l)\right) + \cdots \right]$$

$$S_{\mu,l}^z = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \partial_x \phi_\mu(l) - a_1(-1)^l \cos\left(\sqrt{2\pi}\phi_\mu(l)\right) + \cdots$$

$$J_1 \left( S_{1,j}^+ + S_{1,j+1}^+ \right) S_{2,j}^- + h.c. \sim g_1 \cos\left(\sqrt{4\pi}\phi_+\right) \cos\left(\sqrt{4\pi}\theta_-\right) + g_2 \partial_x \theta_+ \sin\left(\sqrt{4\pi}\theta_-\right)$$

$$\phi_{\pm} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} (\phi_1 \pm \phi_2), \quad \theta_{\pm} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}} (\theta_1 \pm \theta_2)$$

$$K_{\pm} \approx K \mp K^2 \frac{J_1}{\pi \nu}$$

$$K_{\pm} \approx K \mp K^2 \frac{J_1}{\pi \nu}$$

$$K_{\pm} \approx K \mp K^2 \frac{J_1}{\pi \nu}$$

$$K_{\pm}^- = 1 \frac{1}{K_{\pm}^-}$$

Vector chiral phase

p-type nematic Andreev-Grishchuk (1984)

When 
$$g_2 \frac{d\theta_+}{dx} \sin\left(\sqrt{2\pi}\theta_-\right)$$
 is relevant  $\rightarrow \left\langle \sin\left(\sqrt{2\pi}\theta_-\right) \right\rangle \neq 0, \left\langle \frac{d\theta_+}{dx} \right\rangle \neq 0$ 

- Characteristics of the vector chiral state
  - Vector chiral order

$$\chi_{l}^{(1)} = \left\langle \left(\vec{s}_{l} \times \vec{s}_{l+1}\right)^{z} \right\rangle \sim -\left\langle \sin\left(\sqrt{2\pi}\theta_{-}\right) \right\rangle$$
$$\chi_{l}^{(2)} = \left\langle \left(\vec{s}_{l} \times \vec{s}_{l+2}\right)^{z} \right\rangle \sim -\left\langle \frac{d\theta_{+}}{dx} \right\rangle$$

Same sign  $(\chi^{(1)},\chi^{(2)})=(+,+)$  or (-,-)

doubly degenerate ground state

S<sup>x</sup>S<sup>x</sup> & S<sup>x</sup>S<sup>y</sup> spin correlation

Nersesyan-Gogolin-Essler (1998)

Vector chiral order  $\triangleleft \chi < 0$ 



no net spin current flow

$$J_1 \chi_l^{(1)} + 2 J_2 \chi_l^{(2)} = 0$$

 $\left\langle s_0^x s_r^x \right\rangle \sim r^{-\frac{1}{4}K_+} \cos(qr) \quad \left\langle s_0^x s_r^y \right\rangle \sim \pm r^{-\frac{1}{4}K_+} \sin(qr)$ 

power-law decay, incommensurate

A quantum counterpart of the classical helical state

Phase diagram & chiral order parameter  $\langle (\vec{S}_1 \times \vec{S}_2)^z \rangle$ 



#### Chiral order parameter & entanglement entropy



#### **Ground-state phase diagram for Ferro-J<sub>1</sub> case**



# Sine-Gordon model for spin-1/2 $J_1$ - $J_2$ XXZ chain with ferromagnetic coupling $J_1$

We begin with the  $J_2=0$  limit.

 $\mathcal{H}_{J_1} = \sum_{j=1} J_1 \begin{bmatrix} \frac{1}{2} \left( S_j^+ S_{j+1}^- + \text{h.c.} \right) + \Delta S_j^z S_{j+1}^z \end{bmatrix} \begin{array}{c} J_1 < 0 \quad \text{Ferromagnetic} \\ 0 < \Delta < 1 \quad \text{Easy-plane} \\ \Delta = 1 \quad \text{Ferromagnetic} \\ \text{SU(2) Heisenberg} \end{array}$ 

Effective Hamiltonian (sine-Gordon model)

$$H_{\rm eff} = \frac{v}{2} \int dx \left[ K \left( \partial_x \theta \right)^2 + \frac{1}{K} \left( \partial_x \phi \right)^2 - \lambda \cos \left( \sqrt{8\pi} \phi \right) \right]$$

**TL-liquid (free-boson) part** irrelevant perturbation  $\Delta = \cos(\pi \eta), \quad 0 < \eta \le \frac{1}{2}$ 

velocity 
$$v = |J_1| \frac{\sin(\pi \eta)}{2(1-\eta)}$$

TL-liquid parameter  $K = \frac{1}{\eta}$ 

#### Spin and dimer operators

$$\begin{cases} S_{j}^{z} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \partial_{x} \phi + (-1)^{j} \cos(\sqrt{2\pi}\phi) + \dots \\ S_{j}^{\pm} = e^{i\sqrt{2\pi}\theta} \left[ b_{0} + (-1)^{j} b_{1} \cos(\sqrt{2\pi}\phi) + \dots \right] \\ \vec{S}_{j} \cdot \vec{S}_{j+1} - \vec{S}_{j} \cdot \vec{S}_{j-1} = c \left(-1\right)^{j} \sin(\sqrt{2\pi}\phi) + \dots \end{cases}$$



Exact coupling constant for the XXZ chain (J<sub>2</sub>=0)  

$$\lambda_{J_{2}=0} = -\frac{4}{\pi} \sin\left(\frac{\pi}{\eta}\right) \left[\Gamma\left(\frac{1}{\eta}\right)\right]^{2} \left[\frac{\Gamma\left(1+\frac{\eta}{2-2\eta}\right)}{\sqrt{4\pi}\Gamma\left(1+\frac{1}{2-2\eta}\right)}\right]^{\frac{2}{\eta}-2}$$

S. Lukyanov, Nucl. Phys. B (1998)

It vanishes and changes sign at

$$\eta = 1/n$$
 i.e.,  $\Delta = \cos(\pi/n)$   $n = 3, 4, 5, \cdots$ .

1st order correction (in  $\lambda$  ) to excitation gaps of finite systems

$$\frac{L}{v}(E_{\rm D} - E_{\rm N}) = 2\pi\lambda \left(\frac{L}{2\pi}\right)^{2-2/\eta}$$

exact diagonalization

$$\begin{bmatrix} E_D - E_{gs} & \text{``Dimer'' excitation} \\ E_N - E_{gs} & \text{``Neel'' excitation energy} \end{bmatrix}$$
 Level spectroscopy   
K. Okamoto & Kiyohide Nomura

We can find the position of  $\lambda$ =0 using numerical exact-diagonalization method.

$$\frac{L}{v}(E_{\rm D} - E_{\rm N}) = 2\pi\lambda \left(\frac{L}{2\pi}\right)^{2-2/\eta}$$



 $\lambda = 0$  at  $\Delta = \cos(\pi/n)$ 

$$\frac{L}{v}(E_{\rm D} - E_{\rm N}) = 2\pi\lambda \left(\frac{L}{2\pi}\right)^{2-2/\eta}$$

Generally the exact value of  $\lambda$  is not known in the presence of additional perturbations (J<sub>2</sub>).

We can find the position of  $\lambda$ =0 numerically by the condition  $E_{\rm D} - E_{\rm N} = 0$ .



If  $J_2$  perturbation makes the  $\lambda$  term relevant , Neel and dimer phases will emerge.

$$\begin{cases} \lambda > 0 \implies \phi = 0, \sqrt{\pi/2} \implies \cos\left(\sqrt{2\pi}\phi\right) \neq 0 & \text{Neel order} \\ \lambda = 0 \implies \text{Gaussian phase transition point (c=1)} \\ \lambda < 0 \implies \phi = \pm \sqrt{\pi/8} \implies \sin\left(\sqrt{2\pi}\phi\right) \neq 0 & \text{dimer order} \end{cases}$$

Phase diagram and Neel/dimer order parameters

Ground-state phase diagram of easy-plane anisotropic J<sub>1</sub>-J<sub>2</sub> chain



Phase diagram and Neel/dimer order parameters

Ground-state phase diagram of easy-plane anisotropic J<sub>1</sub>-J<sub>2</sub> chain



Direct calculation of order parameters using iTEBD





#### Neel phase

The existence of the Neel phase is against our intuition: ferromagnetic  $J_1 < 0$  & easy-plane anisotropy  $\Delta < 1$ .

Spin-spin correlation functions in the Neel phase



#### Dimer order parameter

$$D_{123}^{xy} := \langle \left[ (S_1^x S_2^x + S_1^y S_2^y) - (S_2^x S_3^x + S_2^y S_3^y) \right] \rangle$$
$$D_{123}^z := \langle (S_1^z S_2^z - S_2^z S_3^z) \rangle$$



# Dimer order parameters - I

 $D_{123}^{xy} := \langle \left[ (S_1^x S_2^x + S_1^y S_2^y) - (S_2^x S_3^x + S_2^y S_3^y) \right] \rangle$  $D_{123}^z := \langle (S_1^z S_2^z - S_2^z S_3^z) \rangle$ 



 $J_1/J_2 = -2$ 

(i)  $D_{123}^{xy} > 0, D_{123}^z < 0$ ``Even-parity dimer phase" **Exact GS (** $J_1/J_2, \Delta$ **)** = (-2, 0) = Product of even-parity dimers  $\uparrow\downarrow + \downarrow\uparrow$ Chubukov, PRB, 1991 Obtained by applying gauge transformation to the singlet dimer state

## **Dimer phases**







#### Dimer order parameters

 $D_{123}^{xy} := \left\langle \left[ \left( S_1^x S_2^x + S_1^y S_2^y \right) - \left( S_2^x S_3^x + S_2^y S_3^y \right) \right] \right\rangle$ 

 $D_{123}^z := \langle (S_1^z S_2^z - S_2^z S_3^z) \rangle$ 



string correlation function

$$\left\langle \left(S_{2j}^{\alpha} + S_{2j+1}^{\alpha}\right) \exp\left[i\pi \sum_{l=j+1}^{k-1} \left(S_{2l}^{\alpha} + S_{2l+1}^{\alpha}\right)\right] \left(S_{2k}^{\alpha} + S_{2k+1}^{\alpha}\right) \right\rangle$$

(2j, 2j+1): dimerized bond





singlet (valence bond)

Sato, Furukawa, Onoda & AF Mod. Phys. Lett. 25, 901 (2011)

# String correlation functions

$$O_{\rm str}^{z}(\ell,\ell+2r) := -\left\langle \left(S_{\ell}^{z} + S_{\ell+1}^{z}\right) \exp\left[i\pi \sum_{m=\ell+2}^{\ell+2r-1} S_{m}^{z}\right] \left(S_{\ell+2r}^{z} + S_{\ell+2r+1}^{z}\right)\right\rangle$$



# 1-loop RG revisited

$$\begin{split} & \mathsf{SU}(2) \text{ symmetric case} \qquad \vec{S}_{\mu,j} = \vec{M}_{\mu}(x) + (-1)^{j} \vec{N}_{\mu}(x) \\ & \mathcal{O}_{\mathrm{bs}} = M_{1R} \cdot M_{1L} + M_{2R} \cdot M_{2L}, \\ & \mathcal{O}_{1} = M_{1R} \cdot M_{2L} + M_{1L} \cdot M_{2R}, \\ & \mathcal{O}_{2} = M_{1R} \cdot M_{2R} + M_{1L} \cdot M_{2L}, \\ & \mathcal{O}_{\mathrm{tw}} = \frac{a}{2} (N_{1} \cdot \partial_{x} N_{2} - N_{2} \cdot \partial_{x} N_{1}), \\ & \mathcal{O}_{\mathrm{tw}} = \frac{a}{2} (\epsilon_{1} \partial_{x} \epsilon_{2} - \epsilon_{2} \partial_{x} \epsilon_{1}). \\ \end{split}$$

$$\begin{split} \dot{G}_{\rm bs} &= G_{\rm bs}^2 + G_{\rm tw}^2 - G_{\rm dtw}^2, \\ \dot{G}_1 &= G_1^2 + G_{\rm tw}^2 - G_{\rm tw}G_{\rm dtw}, \\ \dot{G}_{\rm tw} &= -\frac{1}{2}G_{\rm bs}G_{\rm tw} + G_1G_{\rm tw} - \frac{1}{2}G_1G_{\rm dtw}, \\ \dot{G}_{\rm dtw} &= \frac{3}{2}G_{\rm bs}G_{\rm dtw} - \frac{3}{2}G_1G_{\rm tw}, \end{split}$$

Nersesyan, Gogolin, Essler (1998) Itoi, Qin (2001) Starykh, Balents (2004)

## Numerical integration of 1-loop RG eq.



#### Summary



Furukawa, Sato & AF PRB 81, 094410 (2010)

Sato, Furukawa, Onoda & AF Mod. Phys. Lett. 25, 901 (2011)

Furukawa, Sato, Onoda & AF In preparation (to be submitted to PRB)